

■ EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

INTRODUCTION

The external evaluation expressed in this report focuses on the Project for the Reintroduction of the Portuguese Language (PRLP) in East Timor (Timor-Leste/TL) in the period between 2003 and 2009. This project of the Portuguese Cooperation aims to support the creation of basic conditions in the Timorese society, and particularly, in the education system for the use of Portuguese as an official language and a language of instruction.

According to the Terms of Reference (ToR), the objectives of the evaluation were:

- To assess the PRLP performance level regarding its contribution to improving the education system and education in general in TL;
- To assess the level of results obtained, which include the level of inclusion of the Portuguese language in the Timorese society;
- To assess the functioning of the schools, namely regarding the use of the Portuguese Language as a language of instruction, and the contribution made by the PRLP in this area;
- To identify constraints and possible adjustments to the intervention of the Project, consistent with the expectations of the Timorese and the Portuguese authorities;
- To make recommendations in preparing the new programming cycle of PRLP.

THE INTERVENTION OF PRLP

The PRLP has been developed in East Timor since 2000. The action of the Project is based, fundamentally, on the presence of Portuguese teachers who teach Portuguese and some other areas, particularly in the area of teacher training.

In the period defined for this evaluation (2003-2009), the action of the PRLP in the education system was geared to train the Timorese teachers to use Portuguese as a language of instruction, within their disciplines, and to be responsible for the teaching of Portuguese to the students. In addition to the education sector, the PRLP also directed their Portuguese training to other sectors, with emphasis on Public Administration, and to the media and general public.

EVALUATION DIFFICULTIES

Although the general objective of the use of Portuguese as a teaching language and in the administration was established, the definition of intermediate operational objectives with expected results temporally demarcated and respective verification with those actually achieved, only began to take shape in recent years. Furthermore, the records of the data regarding the Project, both in training and other activities developed and respective indicators and financial resources used, are not systematized for the entire period covered by this evaluation. Thus, the verification of the criteria of effectiveness and efficiency at a given time and between different times of course is difficult.

Another difficulty was to obtain updated and consistent statistical indicators, for some variables in the action of the project, particularly regarding the Timorese's command of different languages and their use in different contexts. We tried to overcome these difficulties through the crossing and referring of the various sources and through direct observation of contexts, during the fieldwork.

RESULTS (according to the evaluation criteria)

- **Implementation Process** – the PRLP progress is marked by the realization of activities according to the general objective of strengthening the use of Portuguese; several constraints prevented some of the structuring activities from occurring as outlined in the beginning (ex. teacher qualifications, through the “Evening Bachelor Degree”);

- **Relevance** – the PRLP is relevant, both to the reality of TL – with a view to supporting the use of Portuguese as an official language, including the aspect of language of instruction, and in terms of training of Timorese teachers – and of Portugal, considering the language as a fundamental axis of Portuguese cooperation;

- **Effectiveness** – considering the various types of constraints, endogenous and exogenous that the PRLP/PCLP has been subjected to, we consider that, on one hand, the range of activities performed in all areas (formal and non formal education, public administration, libraries /toy libraries, media, people in general) is significant, but on the other hand, it is less than expected, especially considering that after a decade, only about 10% of the active teachers without professional qualifications obtained them under the PRLP intervention programs, there are few libraries in operation, the media in the Portuguese language needs a “revolution” and that the training in the public administration and the supply to the population are still insufficient;

- **Efficiency** – It was not possible to assess whether the resources were used at the lowest cost. This limitation is based on two main reasons: firstly, the lack of logical planning, registration and systematization of data in relation to the project activities, for much of the evaluation period, secondly, the absence of similar projects, or those which may be taken as reference, does not allow the comparison of costs in order to assess whether the values applied were close or not to other values taken as a measure. In any case, a substantial part of the costs, relating to salaries of Portuguese teachers, results from a variable determined externally to the project, so that the relation between cost/ results (benefits) can not only be seen from the perspective of the first drawdown, but from the perspective of full use of available resources to maximize results.

- **Effects** — The project presents a probability to produce positive effects (besides the ones already visible) in terms of: a) Professional competence of the teachers; b) Dissemination of the Portuguese language, namely in an academic context; c) Promotion of professional careers and existence of more motivated medium level technicians; d) Wider range of libraries that lack, however, in many cases, an appropriate dynamism; e) Stronger presence,

quantitatively and qualitatively, of the Portuguese language media, reaching a more vast and heterogeneous public (children, adults, etc.); f) Contribution to the creation of a database in the field of education in East Timor; g) Contribution to the clarification of legislative and administrative procedures; h) Contribution to the implementation of Portuguese as an official language, according to what is stated in the Constitution; i) Contribution to the assumption of the Portuguese language as a complementary vehicle for the creation and affirmation of the national Timorese identity.

- **Sustainability** — With regards to the existence of economic and financial sustainability, the project is totally financed by IPAD (The Portuguese Cooperation Agency), where the economic and financial sustainability is dependent on the future projection/ planning on behalf of the Portuguese Cooperation. Conditions are being created for trainers in the PL to become Timorese teachers. There has been a common will for the Portuguese language, as an official language, to be disseminated throughout the territory and used as the language of instruction and work in Timor.

Regarding the contribution of the project to the institutional reinforcement and management capacity, we notice that it has been contributing to the increase of the literacy level in the PL, to the reinforcement of institutional training and to the development of management capacity in TL, through its intervention in the area of training for teachers, public administration, NGO (Non-Governmental Organizations) workers and the public in general, thus aiming to reach the development objectives of the millennium.

- **Coordination and complementarity** — The Project is coordinated and is complemented with other initiatives in course within the scope of the Portuguese language, both directed towards the educational system and the society in general. However, there have not always been enough formal mechanisms of coordination and articulation with other interventions in TE from Portugal and other countries.

The Project is complemented with the intervention of other supporters, namely Brazil, but we verified the non-existence of formal activities of articulation. There is some complementarity with the intervention of other supporters in the area of education, but it does not result from a previous and planned effort for the effect.

- **Added value** — The Project is an important contribution of the Portuguese cooperation for the compliance of what is determined in the Constitution of East Timor and the Framework Law on the Education System with regards to the Portuguese Language. It has also contributed to achieving the millennium goals in East Timor, in particular with regards to poverty reduction and access to Universal Primary Education.

- **Visibility** — The project is known, in general, among its direct intervenients and other international supporters. No specific strategies were foreseen to ensure its visibility, both in Portugal and in East Timor or elsewhere. Within the Project the intervenients continue to have knowledge gaps regarding some fundamental aspects, which reinforces the need to create a

clear, defining image that should be widely disseminated within the national and international community.

CONCLUSIONS

In a summarised way, we can highlight the following:

- C1.** The Reintroduction of the Portuguese Language follows the decision, at first, in the Constitution of the TL, to adopt Portuguese as one of the official languages. We noted a consensus, both from the Portuguese part and the Timorese part, on the strategic importance of the PRLP / PCLP for East Timor. It is clearly a Project that should be continued;
- C2.** In this Project, the Portuguese government has invested 50 million Euros over a decade (2000-2010);
- C3.** This investment has resulted in a significant range of activities, particularly at the level of the education system, public administration, libraries / toy libraries, media and the public in general;
- C4.** A substantial share of this investment has been focused on the education system, especially in training of teachers – initial and continuous;
- C5.** The PRLP has suffered alterations in the guidelines throughout their progress;
- C6.** This alteration in the guidelines is due to various factors, endogenous and exogenous;
- C7.** The PRLP has been facing a set of constraints, which, not being a reason to change its policy, condition, however, its implementation. Here we also have constraints relating to the Portuguese part and the Timorese part;
- C8.** The philosophy of the PRLP went from an initial stake in the training of students to a further investment in Timorese teacher training, seeking a multiplier effect; this reorientation allowed to exploit resources and enhance the role of the Timorese themselves in the reintroduction of the Portuguese language, this reorientation has remained and continues to mark the project intervention;
- C9.** The PRLP has also, recently, when at the recruitment of Portuguese teachers, included a requirement for training in the School of Education in Oporto and in East Timor. These aspects appear to be positive as they aimed to overcome some of the gaps previously accounted for concerning the profile of the Portuguese teachers;
- C10.** In conjunction with the reintroduction of the Portuguese language, the PRLP was a means of action to improve the education system itself, acting on the qualifications of teachers and the need to create a database.

LESSONS LEARNED

The assessment process enabled to learn some lessons, of which we highlight the following:

- For the success of a cooperation project aimed at society, it should, generally, be

assumed by this society, with particular emphasis on the role of the authorities and local officials; in the case of PRLP, the reintroduction or dissemination of a language is done by its use, so there needs to be a combined and concerted effort from all the intervenients in order for the purpose to be achieved; one of the risks for the PRLP/PCLP is to be seen as a Portuguese project, rather than an Timorese project;

- A project must adopt, from the beginning, clear indicators regarding the results to be achieved – and monitor these results throughout its progress, by means of the regular presentation of complete reports; thus, facilitating the decision-taking, aiming to achieve the project's objectives and allowing for its assessment (internal and external);

- An intervention project should be based on perspectives that guide their action and support the reflexion- it must accompany the intervention;

- For the introduction of a language, a global policy is essential, that does not end in academic periods, but that implies the presence in many areas, from the media to the participation in the daily life of the community.

RECOMENDATIONS¹

Cooperation Policy

R1 – Continue to support the Portuguese language consolidation, given the relevance that this has on the assertion in the identity construction of TL, in a regional and international context and in the training of the Timorese society, with particular emphasis to the education sector. (IPAD/TL)

R2 - Express more effectively the political will to implement the use of Portuguese language, as an official language in different contexts. (TL)

R3 – Improve the institutional articulation between Portuguese entities with interventions in the Portuguese language, in which case the IPAD should promote such coordination, both at the design stage and the implementation stage, through regular meetings with all the Portuguese intervenients in the field, in order to promote the complementarity and enhance synergies in the activities of the various intervenients; from this recommendation, specifically, follows a combined and articulated action between the PRLP / PCLP, the Portuguese School (s) (of which the extension of the network is projected) and the *Instituto Camões* / Portuguese Cultural Center, this articulation could provide mechanisms for the integrated use or collaboration of agents assigned to each of the entities. (MNE-IPAD/ME PT)

R4 – The Portuguese Cooperation should work towards greater coordination and articulation of policies and activities relating to the Portuguese language in TL, with other supporters

¹ According to IPAD's information, there were taken in 2010 some measures related to some specific recommendations such as: R4, R6, R7, R12, R14, R15, R18, R19.

and/or intervenients, particularly within the CPPL; this recommendation can be achieved through meetings of coordination and the development of joint activities (Embassy / PCLP).

- R5** - Promote a better gender integration between teachers and students during the project, since there are still some gaps on the Timor context concerning the role that can be played by the Timorese women. (PT / TL)

Articulation with East Timor

- R6** – Articulate Project activities with the authorities in TL, namely in the education sector and other sectors of public administration, integrating them into initiatives and measures with a view to qualification and professional development of trainees in these sectors. (PCLP /LT)
- R7** – Promote the participation of Timorese authorities in the education sector and other administrative sectors in the design, programming, monitoring and evaluation of activities related to each sector, with a view to progressive training and meeting the goals of the Project for these instances. (PCLP/TL)
- R8** – Identify areas of particular relevance to each sector, in each moment, in which it is possible to develop the action of the project - how will the teaching preparation of the new curricula be, in the coming time, in the education sector. (PCPL / TL)
- R9** – Ensure that there is, in the ministries correspondent to the main sectors of intervention with relevance to Education, an intervenient or co-responsible intervenient, nearest to the highest level of the hierarchy in order to enhance the collaboration and participation. (PCLP / ET)
- R10** – Promote a co-responsibility in order to assume the costs related to the project activities.(TL)

Organization and Project Management

- R11** – Clarify priorities and make efforts on the most strategic areas, regarding the existing limited resources and other kind of limitations such as the geographical ones. In this way regarding the teacher training area it could be important to promote the teacher training graduation on specific institutions. Regarding in service teachers training there is a possibility to promote course on s In the case of teachers during the classes' period/on duty the training course can be organised on specific training centers with suitable conditions (a significant number of trainees, out of the regular academic period , available classrooms, pedagogical and logistic resources). (PCLP/TL)
- R12** – Enhance the capacity of coordinating the project, make decisions regarding the management of human and material resources in terms of its didactic and pedagogical dimensions, with the proximity and speed that they require, within general budgetary frameworks and approved activity plans. (Embassy / IPAD)
- R13** – Reinforce the Project coordinator's participation during the meetings with other sponsors/staff and partners who cooperate on the educational development of TL. (PCLP).

- R14** – Improve communication within the project by clarifying and explaining, in reference documents, the purposes to be achieved together, the roles of the intervenients, the supervision system and performance evaluation and the mobility to which they are subjected in the country, for the duration of the contract. (Embassy / IPAD)
- R15** – Deepen the systematic collection and processing of information policy regarding the management of the Project, in general, and for each activity, such as indicators of progress and achievement. (PCLP)
- R16** – Improve the project administrative procedures, namely reducing the time of the training certification process. (PCLP/TL)
- R17** – Adopt a policy of regular (self) evaluation of the intervention of the Project, in its multiple dimensions, to assess the effectiveness of the methodologies used and the results obtained in each activity and sector of intervention. (PCLP)
- R18** – Expand the role of the scientific and pedagogic advice in the recruitment of teachers, extending it to the various sub-contingents in order to clarify pedagogical orientations, promote the knowledge of the curriculum and skills of the recruited and to create bonds of (co-) accountability; (PCLP)
- R19** – Give greater visibility to the project, particularly through the media, by publishing activities and giving institutional and mediatic importance to its completion and to the results obtained. (PCLP)

Scientific-Pedagogical Approach

- R20** – Clarify the pedagogical-didactic and methodological guidelines established for the various intervention activities in the command of the language in the context of East Timor, explaining them in meetings and in documents prepared for the purpose, in order to enable the teachers to assimilate them, in a sustained and consistent way and with a view to enrichment. (PCLP / ESE-IPP)
- R21** – Strengthen the training of the Project's teachers, which should prepare for the entry into office, contemplating, mainly, matters relating to the linguistic diversity of TL (with a focus on the characteristics of Tetum), cultural matters (for TL and the region in which this country is included) pedagogic (taking into account the specificity of target audiences with whom they will work) and didactic (PL as a second language), this training must accompany the exercise of functions, deepening some of the material and gathering the contributions from the practice and the initiatives developed by teachers. (PCLP / ESE-IPP)
- R22** – Obtain the accreditation of the continuous training sessions intended for Portuguese teachers, which will strengthen their institutionalization and appreciation in their professional progress; the undertaking of these training sessions may be coordinated with other entities, for example, the Portuguese School. (PCLP / ESE-IPP)
- R23** – Establish, within the Project, a production orientation and knowledge sharing, encouraging research and production and testing of materials, prepared with the aim of

appropriateness to context and to specific target audiences of the project intervention; this approach might lead to the pursuit of academic courses, an open action field with higher education institutions, whether Portuguese or Timorese, particularly with the UNTL, and allows an active participation, substantiated and specialized in scientific and pedagogic forums. (PCLP / ESE-IPP)

R24 – Elaborate, in conjunction with the previous recommendation, specialized support material for each course, creating for the effect, specific teams; thus, the support to new teachers and their integration in the Project shall be facilitated. (PCLP/ESE-IPP)

R25 – Implement and develop activities of/in the PL that may take advantage of the new technologies, namely the Internet, developing the interaction with other speakers of the PL; in that sense, the project “*Rostos de Esperança*” may gain a new dynamism, accompanying the broader access to Internet in East Timor, which is expected to increase in the near future and the dynamism of libraries/centre of educational resources should gain a new impulse, in an integrated way with the use of information and communication technologies. (PCLP)